Citizenship in the context of immigration and emigration

Options course for
- MSc in Migration Studies (home option)
- MSc in Refugee and Forced Migration Studies
- MPhil in Development Studies

**Lecturers**

**Dr Evelyn Ersanilli**  
Departmental Lecturer in Migration Studies, Department of International Development  
E-mail: evelyn.ersanilli@qeh.ox.ac.uk

**Dr Sarah Garding**  
Post-doctoral Research Officer, School of Interdisciplinary Area Studies  
E-mail: sarah.garding@area.ox.ac.uk

**Time and place**
Hilary Term, Weeks 1-8, Monday, 4-6 pm  
Seminar Room 3, Queen Elizabeth House

**Overview**
Citizenship can refer to a legal status, a set of rights, an individual’s engagement in political life, or an identity. The course examines these different aspects of citizenship in the context of migration. Every state is tasked with defining membership and rights within the broader political community. Yet migration – both immigration and emigration – challenges the ideal-typical vision of a state wherein the borders of the citizenry perfectly coincide with territorial borders, and where citizens belong to the same nation forged by an (invented) shared history.

The course draws on theories and research from politics, sociology, anthropology, and history. It covers cases from most regions of the world, including Western Europe, North America, East Central Europe, the Middle East, and Africa. By looking at countries with different nation-building and migration histories, political systems, and levels of economic development, the course aims to enrich students’ understanding of citizenship.

The course is divided into three parts. The first part of this course looks at the state’s efforts to define and control its citizenry. What are the key principles used to establish who belongs and who does not? How is citizenship crafted in new states and post-conflict states, where the imperatives of nation building, state building, and reconciliation often collide?

The second part of the course looks at how migrants’ political engagement and identities are shaped by citizenship policies. When and why do migrants remain active citizens in their home countries? When and why do they become engaged in their host state’s political life? Are homeland-oriented and host-state oriented active citizenship necessarily contradictory? And how do citizenship policies affect identity?

The final section of the course looks at several emerging issues in citizenship research. We will look at the relationship between regionalism and citizenship within regional organizations in Europe, Africa, Southeast Asia, and the Americas. We will also look the trend of selectively liberal citizenship policies towards wealthy individuals and athletes.

At the end of the course, students will have a thorough understanding of citizenship’s role in rights, identity, and status, and how it affects the lives of emigrants and immigrants.
Teaching Arrangements
The course will be taught through eight two-hour sessions in Hilary Term. The course has a highly interactive nature and requires an active attitude from the students. Students are expected to write an essay, give a class presentation and engage in critical discussion during the class (45 minutes). The lecturers will structure the debates and relate them to each other in a mini-lecture at the end of the seminar stressing the take-home points of that week. Students are expected to come to each seminar with knowledge of the required readings.

Essay and presentation
You should write an essay of approximately 2,500 words on one of the questions listed below. You should submitted your essay via email to the lecturers and students by 6pm on Thursday the preceding week. At the start of the class you will give a 15 minute presentation on your essay (in weeks with 1 essay) or a joint 30 minute presentation (in weeks with 2 essays). We aim to return written feedback on your essay by the end of the week of your presentation.

Course Outline and essay questions
Week 1 - Citizenship in the context of immigration and emigration. An introduction (EE/SG)

Week 2. Who is a citizen? The power of states, societies and migrants (EE)
1. What are the consequences of weakly institutionalised citizenship for migrants?
2. “It is through written documents [.] that much of the surveillance entailed by modern state administration is carried out” (Torpey, 2000:15). Discuss with reference to states with weak bureaucracies.

Week 3 - Citizenship and nation building in new states (SG)
1. What are the key challenges to developing citizenship frameworks in new, post-conflict states in Africa and postcommunist Europe? How are states’ policy responses similar/different?
2. How can new, post-conflict states reconcile their desire to strengthen national cohesion and loyalty to the state with the realities of heterogeneous populations residing within state borders?

Week 4 - Long-distance citizenship? Migrant involvement in home country politics (SG)
1. When and why do states “engage” their diasporas? What do you find to be the most compelling explanation, and why?
2. Considering how actively emigrants lobby for the right to vote, why do so few of them vote in homeland elections in practice?

Week 5 - Active citizenship: When do immigrants participate in host country politics? (SG)
1. In your view, which factor(s) best explain(s) variation in immigrants’ involvement in political affairs in the host country?
2. How does immigrant political incorporation highlight the different “lenses” of citizenship that we have discussed in this course?

Week 6 - How do citizenship policies affect immigrants’ sense of belonging? (EE)
1. “Although a civic conception of citizenship is reflected in policies, everyday reality reflects a ‘thicker’ notion of citizenship” (Ersanilli and Saharso, 2011: 931) Discuss.
2. What can we learn from comparing immigrants’ sense of belonging in Europe and the Gulf region?
**Week 7 - Regionalism, labour mobility, and citizenship (SG)**

1. “European citizenship constitutes a unique experiment for stretching social and political bonds beyond national boundaries... [It] can be the prototype for institutional experimentation on citizenship on a global scale. (Kostakopoulou 2007, pg. 624). Discuss

2. In terms of legal status and rights, how do citizenship and worker mobility vary under different regional organizations/agreements?

**Week 8 - Who deserves to be a citizen? Olympic and investor citizenship (EE)**

1. Are Olympic citizenship, investor citizenship and the rise in citizenship tests all part of the same trend or are they paradoxical? Why?

2. The rise in investor citizenship programmes attests that contrary to the claim of authors such as Soysal and Spiro citizenship is still valuable. Discuss

**Readings**

**Week 1 – Citizenship in the context of immigration and emigration. An introduction.**

*This will be a joint lecture introducing the course, outlining its structure and how the different sessions will speak to each other. The different meanings of citizenship will be discussed. Citizenship can refer to a status, a set of rights, an identity or a mode of participation. What does each of these dimensions entail? What types of rights do citizenship have? What do states expect of citizens and what can citizens and non-citizens expect of the state? We recommend to first read Kymlicka, then Brubaker then the other two texts. At the end of the session the division of essays will take place.*

*Brubaker, R. (1992) Citizenship and nationhood in France and Germany Cambridge: Harvard – chapter 1 (pp 21-34), Chapter 4 (pp75-84).*


Week 2 - Determining who is a citizen. The power of states, societies and migrants

*Much of the citizenship literature implicitly assumes that states are able them to determine who is a citizen and who is not, as well as enforce those decisions. However, in countries with weak institutions and ethnic groups that live in regions spanning multiple states, it is difficult to determine who does and who does not belong to the citizenry as defined by nationality laws. As Sadiq (2008) points out this can lead to undocumented natives and ‘documentary citizenship’ of irregular migrants. This session looks at how migrants, local and national authorities may use ambiguities about citizenship status to their advantage. You are recommended to first read Torpey and then the three other readings.*


Balaton-Chrimes, S (2014) Statelessness, identity cards and citizenship as status in the case of the Nubians of Kenya, Citizenship Studies 18(1)  
Economist (2011) ‘India’s identity revolution’ (short piece on India’s Unique Identification project aimed at improving the provision of public services to all Indians).  
Economist (2012) ‘India’s north-east. A neglected crisis Violence in distant Assam boils over in the rest of the country’  
Economist (2014) ‘The border is not the problem’ (on why irregular migrants prefer Britain over France and why increased border control in the US might do little to reduce the number of irregular migrants).  
Irin news (2014) Statelessness = invisibility in West Africa  
Week 3 - Citizenship and Nation-Building in New States

The process of defining membership in the national political community is contentious in any state, but in new, and especially post-conflict, states the process can be particularly problematic. What are the unique challenges of balancing the imperatives of sovereignty, nation building, and keeping the peace in post-conflict societies? How are “initial” citizenries determined in new states, and how do new states deal with “liminality” (see Riggan’s article)? How does the contemporary process of exerting “state-ness” through citizenship differ from its historical counterpart? What role do external actors and international norms play in drafting/moderating citizenship policies in new states? This session explores these questions by looking at citizenship policies and citizenship education in new and/or post-conflict states.


Week 4 – Long-distance citizenship? Migrant involvement in home country politics

Most states remain connected to their emigrants to an extent, but some states are particularly proactive in engaging emigrants and their progeny born abroad, often wrapping their claims to diaspora populations in the language of belonging and nationhood. Emigrants, in turn, also often wish to retain rights in the origin country, most importantly the right of re-entry and settlement, but also political rights to influence the future of their origin country. This session will look at the range of claims made on and by emigrants and discusses what this means for the conception of citizenship through its various lenses.


*Gezer, Ozlem and Anna Reimann. “Erdogan Urges Turks Not to Assimilate: ‘You Are Part of Germany, But Also Part of Our Great Turkey.’” Der Spiegel, February 28, 2011.


*Suro, Roberto, and Gabriel Escobar (2006) “Survey of Mexicans Living in the U.S. on Absentee Voting in Mexican Elections.” Pew Hispanic Center Report. Please read the overview only; it is not necessary to read the entire report.


Week 5 - Active Citizenship: When do Immigrants Participate in Host Country Politics?

Political incorporation is the process through which individuals engage in and are engaged by political institutions. In previous sessions we looked at the policy side of incorporation – the policies that shape and constrain migrant political incorporation. This session explores variation in the behavioural aspects of migrants’ political incorporation (“active” citizenship) – voting in elections, acquiring citizenship, running for office, and participating in protests or civic associations. How do generational factors, country of origin effects, socioeconomic factors, and meso-level organizations like unions and migrant associations affect behavioural aspects of immigrant incorporation?

*Dronkers, Jaap and Maarten Peter Vink (2012) “Explaining access to citizenship in Europe: how citizenship policies affect naturalization rates,” European Union Politics, 13(3): 390-412


Week 6 – How do citizenship policies affect immigrants’ sense of belonging?
The intense debate around citizenship and immigrant integration policies seems to suggest that policies are a very important factor in determining the lives of immigrants. Last week we looked at the determinants of political participation. This week we will look at how identity of immigrants and their children is influenced by the policies of their countries of residence.


Week 6 – How do citizenship policies affect immigrants’ sense of belonging?

Street, Alex (2014) “My child will be a citizen: intergenerational motives for naturalization,” World Politics 66(2) 264-292


Week 7 - Regionalism, Labour Mobility, and Citizenship

Since the end of World War II, there has been a move towards regionalism. In various guises and with varying degrees of economic and political integration (as well as varying liberalization of capital and labour mobility), regionalism introduces a host of issues concerning citizenship, mobility, and rights. This session looks at citizenship and labour mobility issues in regional supranational organizations and trade agreements like the European Union, the North American Free Trade Agreement, the Economic Community of West African States, the Association of Southeast Asian Nations, and the Caribbean Community. How have these regional associations reshaped the mobility of capital, goods, and labour, and with what implications and challenges for citizenship?


*(Please skim) Sirat, Morshidi et al, “Towards harmonization of higher education in Southeast Asia,” Inside Higher Education, April 13, 2014..


MacLaren, Barbara (2008) Labour Mobility and Trade in the Americas: Current Frameworks and Socio-Economic Implications. Ottawa, Canada: Canadian Foundation for the Americas. Available here


Week 8 – Who deserves to be a citizen? Investor and Olympic citizenship

Over the last decade, several European countries have implemented or formalised their citizenship tests. Several have added oaths of allegiance and set-up citizenship ceremonies. These changes have mostly been justified by a desire to grant citizenship to those who deserve citizenship by virtue of speaking the language and knowing the history and culture of the country. While these can been seen as a restriction of access to citizenship, other pathways have been more open. St Kitts and Nevis grants citizenship to those who invest substantial sum, advertising it as ‘the smart way for you and your family to secure your future prosperity’. Several other countries in the Caribbean, Europe and the Americas offer citizenship or residence permits (a first step towards citizenship) to rich investors. Top-athletes can obtain citizenship if they commit to competing in international competitions on behalf of their new country. In this session we will discuss what these fast-tracks to citizenship imply for the connection between citizenship status and identity and how they relate to the spread of citizenship tests. We will also revisit the argument that citizenship has lost all value because few rights depend upon it (Soysal, 1994; Spiro, 2008).


Valchards, G. (2014) ‘Austria: Ministry considers list of naturalized VIPs as “official secret”’, EUDO observatory on citizenship