

**Debating Immigration and Citizenship in Europe and the US**  
**Professor Martin A. Schain, Spring 2014**

*Seminar in Comparative Politics*  
V53.0595: Tuesdays, 3:30-6PM,  
12 Waverly Place, Room L113

In this seminar we will focus on the political debates about immigration and citizenship policy in Europe and the United States. Although we will spend some time analyzing and comparing the policies themselves, we will be most concerned with how these policies are framed, and how the issues are debated. This will be an active seminar, which will require each of you to engage in a set of debates about immigration and citizenship, to take a position and to defend it. Although the subject matter is important, this seminar is about the process of civic discourse.

In the **first section** of this course, I will give a series of lectures, and present a set of questions that we will discuss. We will examine how the political issues of immigration have been developed and constructed in the Europe and the United States. We will then look at how questions of immigration have challenged different elements of citizenship, as it has been understood in Europe and the United States. For the **second section**, I have invited five prominent scholars, and I have asked each of them to present an issue/policy position that they have written about and advocated in the scholarly literature. For each of these sessions, I will act as the primary discussant to challenge what they present, and I will ask several you to follow with questions and/or disagreements. In the **third section** we will break into teams for formal debates on questions that have emerged out of the previous sessions.

I have asked you to purchase the following book:

Martin A. Schain, *The Politics of Immigration in France, Britain and the United States: A Comparative Study*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (New York: Palgrave, 2012)

I am also recommending, but not requiring, the following book:

Carol M. Swain, editor, *Debating Immigration* (Cambridge University Press, 2007)

Finally, I will make available to you a standard handbook on college debate for the third section of the course.

## January 28: Introduction

### I. Questions of immigration and citizenship

#### 1. February 4: Issues of Immigration in Comparative Perspective

Schain, *The Politics of Immigration...*, chs. 1 and 3

Messina, *The Logics and Politics of Post WW-II Immigration...*, Ch. 2\*

Schain review of Caldwell\*

#### 2. February 11: Issues of Immigration in the United States

Schain, *The Politics of Immigration...*, chs. 8 and 9

Susan Martin, “Unauthorized Migration...”\*

#### 3. February 18: Citizenship issues in Comparative Perspective

Rogers Brubaker, *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany*(This book is also an e-book:  
[https://ezproxy.library.nyu.edu/login?url=http://name.umdl.umich.edu/H  
EB01814](https://ezproxy.library.nyu.edu/login?url=http://name.umdl.umich.edu/H<br/>EB01814)), Ch. 1

MM Howard, “The Citizenship Debate”\*

#### 4. February 25: Issues of Citizenship in the United States

Schuck in Joppke, *Challenge to the Nation-State...*.\*

Spiro in Hansen and Weil, *Dual Nationality...*.\*

### II. Scholars Debate Immigration and Citizenship

#### 5. March 4— Professor Lawrence Mead (New York University): Immigration: The Cultural Issue.

Reading: “Immigration: The Cultural Dimension”\*

Reading: “The Moral Community and Immigration”\*

#### 6. March 11— Marc Rosenblum (Congressional Research Service): The Congressional Politics of Immigration in the United States

Reading: Tichenor and Rosenblum, “Poles Apart” \*

7. **March 25—Professor Peter Schuck (Yale and New York University Law Schools): Debating Birthright Citizenship**  
Reading: “Birthright of a Nation”\*  
Reading: “Consensual Citizenship”
8. **April 1—Professor Chebel-d’Appollonia (Rutgers and Sciences Po Paris): Immigrant Mobilization as a Response to Securitization**  
Reading: \*
9. **April 8-- Professor Susan Martin (Georgetown/ISIM): Understanding Undocumented Immigration from a Comparative Perspective**  
Reading: “Irregular Migration, State Security and Human Security”\*

### **III. Students Debate Immigration (propositions to be announced)**

10. **April 15**—Team I: Citizenship (US)
11. **April 22**—Team II: Citizenship (Europe)
12. **April 29**—Team III: Immigration/integration (US)
13. **May 5**—Team IV: Immigration/integration (Europe)