

The Politics of Citizenship and Naturalization

Gov 94cb – Spring 2018

Instructor: Dr. Colin Brown
E-mail: brown4@fas.harvard.edu



Flickr user marsdd, Creative Commons License

Anyone born in the United States is automatically an American citizen. In most European countries, birthright citizenship is rarely guaranteed unless one's parents are already citizens. The Netherlands and Germany have recently made it easier to become German and Dutch nationals, while one of the few European countries that had birthright citizenship (Ireland) abandoned it at around the same time. And, try as one might, it is very difficult to lose or give up Moroccan citizenship, even if one wants to!

This course seeks to examine the very different conceptions of citizenship in different states and at different times, particularly through the lens of migration. What does being a citizen of a state mean in a modern sense, and why is it the focus of so much of the current European and American debate over migration? How are policies about who belongs and who becomes a citizen determined? How has naturalization policy changed over time, and how have debates over citizenship and migration changed the overall political system?

Learning Goals

Students should leave the course able to:

- Identify citizenship requirements in the US and several other contexts.
- Compare citizenship and naturalization requirements, and describe how requirements change over time.
- Summarize the political factors that led to the development of citizenship regimes and that lead to changes.
- Describe the concepts of transnationalism, multiculturalism, and asylum, and explain how they affect citizenship policies
- Summarize and critique the ethical and value-based arguments made for different concepts of citizenship, and use the theoretical literature to advocate for or against these.
- Extrapolate from past debates to identify the most important arguments in the current debate, and make predictions about future developments in citizenship policy
- Identify and outline potential research questions to contribute to the political science literature on citizenship

Requirements:

- Participation: 20%
 - Active participation in discussion section, coming to class having done the readings for the week, contributing to collaborative readings online.
- Short Response Papers: 15%
 - Due: Sunday night at midnight, any 6 weeks of class (your choice)
 - 1 full page, unedited, initial reaction to at least one (or more) readings from the week
 - This will be easier if you start early in the semester!
- In-Class Presentation: 10%
 - Due: Twice throughout the semester (sign up in small groups via Canvas)
 - Students will summarize one of the assigned readings from these weeks, offer critical commentary, and lead ~20 minutes of class discussion
- 2 Short Essays: 20% total
 - Due: Feb. 26, March 26, and/or April 16 by start of class
 - 5-6 pages, edited and polished, in response to an assigned prompt
 - Choose any **two** of the three assigned prompts; skip one of your choice.
- Annotated Review: 5%
 - Due: April 30th at 4pm
 - Offer critical commentary and suggested revisions on a new, assigned article using the collaborative reading software.
- Final Paper: 30%
 - Due: May 4th at 12pm
 - Students will have three options for the final assignment and need only do one of the following; all will be weighted equally:
 1. A 15-18 page term paper on the topic of the student's choice. Students may choose to revisit and expand one of the short essays submitted earlier in the semester
 2. A 10-15 page senior thesis proposal on a topic related to the course
 3. 2x 800-1000 word book reviews on *additional* readings, selected by the student and instructor together.

Late Policy:

- In-class presentations and the short response papers are necessary for the flow of the seminar. Extensions are impossible.
- The final paper is assigned as late as Harvard College will allow. Extensions are impossible.
- The short essays and the annotated review may be turned in up to 3 days late, no questions asked, but will incur a penalty equal to a full letter grade if turned in after the deadline. If there are extenuating circumstances, please convey them to the instructor via your House Dean.

Accommodations for students with disabilities

Students needing academic adjustments or accommodations because of a documented disability must present their Faculty Letter from the Accessible Education Office (AEO) and speak with the professor by the end of the second week of the term. Failure to do so may result in the Course Head's inability to respond in a timely manner.

Collaboration Policy

Discussion and the exchange of ideas are essential to academic work. For any written work in this course, you are encouraged to consult with your classmates on the choice of topics, to share sources, and to engage in peer review. However, you should ensure that any written work you submit for evaluation is the result of your own research and writing and that it reflects your own approach to the topic. You must also adhere to standard citation practices in this discipline and properly cite any books, articles, websites, lectures, etc. that have helped you with your work. If you received any help with your writing (feedback on drafts, etc), you must also acknowledge this assistance in the submitted paper. Help from resources like the College Writing Center and

the Departmental Writing Fellow are also encouraged, but this assistance must also be acknowledged.

As an exception, the annotated review at the end of the semester should be treated like an exam and must not be discussed with other students in the class. Students who acknowledge they have read and agree to this collaboration policy by e-mailing the instructor with a list of which course assignments allow and do not allow collaboration, by the beginning of the second class section, will receive a small (edible) reward during that class; students who do not get nothing but a disapproving look from the instructor.

Required Books (available at the Coop and on reserve at Lamont Library):

- Sofya Aptekar: The Road to Citizenship: What Naturalization Means for Immigrants and the United States. Rutgers: 2015
- Marc Morjé Howard: The Politics of Citizenship in Europe. Cambridge: 2009
- Yasemin Soysal: Limits of Citizenship: Migrants and Postnational Membership in Europe. Chicago: 1995.
- Ayelet Shachar: The Birthright Lottery. Harvard: 2009

Schedule

Unit 1: Background

What are the current trends in migration, and to whom do current citizenship policies apply? What is the current political atmosphere surrounding migration and citizenship?

Jan. 22: (Shopping Week): Immigration Trends in the United States and Europe

Jan. 29: Immigration Politics in the United States and Europe

- OECD International Migration Outlook 2017, Chap. 1, pp 13-56 (skim for big picture and broad view of data; don't worry about specific details yet)
- Martin Schain, The Politics of Immigration in France, Britain and Germany, Chapters 8 & 10, pp. 181-206, 237-274
- **Aptekar**, pp. 1-45
- Yascha Mounk, "Why I Still Want to Be an American Citizen," Slate, 12/6/16

Unit 2: The Meaning of Citizenship

How do states and politics determine what citizenship should mean? How has this changed across time? How have nationalism and discourses about human rights affected citizenship and naturalization policies?

Feb. 5: What is Citizenship? Part 1

- Christian Joppke, Immigration and Citizenship, Polity: 2010, Chapter 1, pp. 1-33
- **Aptekar**, pp. 46-144
- Yuna Blajer de la Garza, "Blending In: Citizenship and Belonging in France and Mexico in the 21st Century." Working Paper, University of Chicago 2018, pp. 1-6, 11-35
- Videos (see Canvas site): Naturalization Ceremonies in U.S., Canada, Ireland

Feb. 12: What is Citizenship? Part 2

- Michael Walzer, "Membership," in The Immigration Reader, David Jacobson, ed. Chapter 16, pp. 341-364
- Joseph Carens, The Ethics of Immigration, Oxford: 2013. Chapters 2 & 3, pp. 19-61
- Smith, Rogers. 1993. "Beyond Tocqueville, Myrdal, and Hartz: The Multiple Traditions in America." *American Political Science Review* 87 (3): 549-66.
- *Optional but Recommended: Benedict Anderson, Imagined Communities, Verso: 2006 (Revised Edition), Chapters 2 & 3, pp. 9-48*

Unit 3: Types of Citizenship Policy

How have citizenship policies been amended during current waves of immigration? What approaches have been adopted? How have they affected migrants? How have they affected countries' political debates?

Feb. 19: No Class (Presidents' Day)

Feb. 26 : Trends in Citizenship Policy, Part 1

Short Essay 1 Due

- Michael Janoski, The Ironies of Citizenship, Cambridge: 2010, Chapter 4 "From Manifest Destiny to Multicultural Diversity in the Settler Countries," pp. 89-123
- Peter H. Schuck, "Immigrants' Political and Legal Incorporation in the United States after 9/11: Two Steps Forward, One Step Back" in Bringing Outsiders In, Jennifer Hochschild and John Mollenkopf, eds., Cornell: 2009 pp. 158-175
- "Overview of INS History," U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service, 2012
- Edward Erler, "Trump's Critics Are Wrong about the 14th Amendment," and John Yoo, "On Citizenship, the 'Birthers' Are Right," *National Review*, August 2015
- *Tuaua v United States* (D.C. Cir. 2015): Amicus brief in favor, Puerto Rican Bar Association; Amicus brief in opposition, Government of American Samoa; Denial of certiorari

March 5 : Trends in Citizenship Policy, Part 2

Skype Q & A with Sharon Barney, Esq. (Immigration and Family Attorney)

- Sara Wallace Goodman, Immigration and Member Politics in Western Europe, Oxford: 2014. pp. 1-12, 16-36
- **Howard**, Introduction and Chapters 2-7, pp. 1-16 and 37-168
- Nancy Foner, "Is Islam in Western Europe Like Race in the United States?" Sociological Forum 30(4), 2015: 885-899
- Ahmet İcduygu and Damla B. Aksel "Migration Realities and State Responses: Rethinking International Migration Policies in Turkey," in *Social Transformation and Migration*, Stephen Castles, Derya Ozkul, and Magdalena Arias Cubas, eds. Palgrave Macmillan: 2015, 115-129

March 12: No Class (Spring Recess)

March 19: Debating Naturalization Policy

- Irene Bloemraad: Becoming a Citizen: Incorporating Immigrants and Refugees in the United States and Canada. University of California: 2006, pp. 1-16.
- IntelligenceSquared US: "Motion: Give Undocumented Immigrants a Path to Citizenship"
 - *Shorter podcast version required; longer video version optional but recommended*
- Consideration of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) - U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service
- Roberto G. Gonzales, Lives in Limbo: Undocumented and Coming of Age in America. University of California: 2015, pp. 208-235
- Additional short readings on current developments TBD

Unit 4: Multiculturalism and Citizenship

What is multiculturalism, and is it still a relevant concept? What normative arguments have been made for and against multiculturalism as a policy? Why has so much of the multiculturalism debate in Europe focused on Islam?

March 26: Origins of Multiculturalism

Short Essay 2 Due

- Augie Fleras, The Politics of Multiculturalism, Palgrave MacMillan: 2009, Chapters 3 & 4, pp. 55-112
- Han Entzinger, "The Rise and Fall of Multiculturalism: The Case of The Netherlands" in Towards Assimilation and Citizenship, Christian Joppke and Eva Morawska, eds., Palgrave MacMillan: 2003, pp.

59-86

- Will Kymlicka, "The Rise and Fall of Multiculturalism?" in The Multiculturalism Backlash, Steven Vertovec and Susanne Wessendorf, eds., Routledge: 2010. pp. 32-49

April 2: The Backlash

- Betty de Hart, "The End of Multiculturalism: The End of Dual Citizenship?" in Dual Citizenship in Europe, Thomas Faist, ed. Ashgate: 2007, pp.77-102
- Paul Scheffer, Immigrant Nations, Polity: 2011. Chapter 1, pp. 1-33
- Tariq Modood. "Muslims and the Politics of Difference." The Political Quarterly 74 (2003): 100-115
- Christopher Caldwell, Reflections on the Revolution in Europe, Chapter 6

Unit 5: The Future of Citizenship?

What other trends are emerging in citizenship policy, and how might these debates develop in the future?

April 9: Transnationalism

- **Soysal**, Chaps. 1, 2, 3, & 8
- Eva Østergaard-Nielsen, "The End of Closet Political Transnationalism" in Bringing Outsiders In, Jennifer Hochschild and John Mollenkopf, eds., Cornell: 2009, pp. 195-210

April 16: Refugees and Asylum Seekers

Short Essay 3 Due

- Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951 & 1967
- David Haines, Safe Haven? A History of Refugees in America, pp. 1-20; 57-75
- Joseph Carens, "What's Philosophy Got to Do With It? - On Morality and the Refugee Crisis," Interview with University of Toronto student newspaper: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uO48ieEuw2I>
- Case Study: "Run for the Border," Harvard Law School (HNMCP)

April 23: Future Trends

- **Shachar**, Introduction and Chaps. 4, 5, & 6: pp. 1-15, 111-190
- Linda Bosniak, John Echeverri-Gent, Terri Givens, Jane Junn: "Symposium: The Birthright Lottery," Perspectives on Politics 9(3): 621-637
- Additional short readings on current developments, TBD

Annotated Review Due April 30th at 4pm

Final Paper Due May 4th at Noon

Readings to be done collaboratively (see Canvas for details):

Feb. 12: Walzer

Feb. 26: Janoski

Mar. 5: Foner

Mar. 19: Bloemraad

Apr. 2: Scheffer

Apr. 9: Østergaard-Nielsen

Apr. 23: Readings TBD